

Relocation Policy of Street Vendors in Malioboro: Review of Policy Formulation Analysis Study

Sayidah Ummul Solihah ¹, Rahma Audyna Gita Evellinda ²

¹ Department of Government Affairs and Administration, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia

² Department of Government Affairs and Administration, Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Corresponding Author: sayidahummul@gmail.com

Article Info



Article History;

Received:

2024-02-15

Revised:

2024-03-01

Accepted:

2024-03-16

Abstract: In public policy formulation, the interests and welfare of the community must be prioritized as the direction for policy formulators. Policy formulation is oriented towards the needs, desires, and interests of the community so that later it will receive full support from the community. Policy formulation is also a very important stage and must be carried out appropriately and comprehensively. The stages in the policy formulation process are problem identification, agenda setting, policy problem formulation, and policy design. In the process of policy formulation for the relocation of Malioboro street vendors, problem identification is first carried out to identify existing problems based on the infrastructure aspects of facilities and infrastructure, such as the loss of pedestrian rights due to street vendors selling on the sidewalk. The policy formulation by the government can finally be realized little by little. The relocation policy of Malioboro street vendors affects tourist visits, which indirectly affects the street vendors. With the relocation of street vendors, they get adequate public facilities, ease of mobility for traders, security guarantees, and time efficiency.

Keywords: Policy Formulation; Malioboro Street; Relocation Policy.

INTRODUCTION

In the process of making public policy, there is a crucial stage known as policy formulation. This involves action and interaction within the community aimed at producing the policy itself. In public policy formulation, prioritizing the interests and welfare of the community serves as the guiding principle for policymakers. The policy formulation is oriented towards the needs, desires, and interests of the community, thereby ensuring full support for the policy later on. The policy formulation stage is pivotal and must be conducted thoroughly and comprehensively. Failure to carry out the policy formulation appropriately and comprehensively may result in having a formulated policy that does not achieve its optimal target. For instance, in relocating street vendors (PKL) in Malioboro, the Yogyakarta government initially conducted a policy formulation stage to identify problems and adjust policies to the interests and needs of PKL (Amanta a Kusumasari, 2019).

The stages in the policy formulation process include problem identification, agenda setting, policy problem formulation, and policy design (Alaslan 2021). Actors narrate various public policy issues with persuasive strategies to formulate a policy (Amri, Nurmandi, a Mutiarin 2023). In formulating policies for relocating Malioboro street vendors, the first step involves identifying problems related to infrastructure, such as pedestrian rights being compromised due to vendors selling on the sidewalks. Additionally, the social aspect includes the legality of the street vendors

themselves, as well as the cultural aspect, where Yogyakarta is designated as a cultural heritage with Malioboro as one of the axes of cultural philosophy. Issues that occur in Malioboro are used as a policy agenda by policy makers which will later be processed into a policy to solve problems (Amri, Nurmandi, a Mutiarin 2022). Lastly, the spatial aspect, ensuring Malioboro's spatial arrangement is orderly and free from space misuse. The next step is agenda setting, where these identified issues are narrowed down for further action.

The next stage of policy problem formulation involves defining existing problems, analyzing their substance, and establishing goals and objectives for the policies to be formulated. In the policy problem formulation stage, the government determines the purpose of the policy, which is to provide legality for street vendors, goods, and places where they sell (Pratiwi, Sari, & Praditya 2022). Providing comfort for visitors or tourists when visiting Malioboro and maintaining the suitability of Malioboro's layout, which is one of the axes of Yogyakarta's cultural heritage philosophy. The final stage of policy formulation is policy design, where policymakers develop policies according to goals and objectives. They must also anticipate the potential impact or implications of the policy once it is implemented. In this case, the government built Malioboro Terrace as a solution for selling places for street vendors, thereby eliminating the need for them to sell on the sidewalk.

Government policy formulation for the relocation of Malioboro street vendors has gradually been implemented. This policy has impacted tourist visits, which in turn affects the street vendors indirectly. The relocation of street vendors provides adequate public facilities, ease of mobility for traders, security guarantees, and time efficiency. According to observations by Aotama & Klavart (2021), the Malioboro terrace buildings are now enclosed and equipped with modern, spacious facilities, including vendor stalls, bathrooms, prayer rooms, and free electricity. It can be felt directly from the results of observations by Aotama & Klavert (2021). In terms of mobility, all stalls are stationary, eliminating the frequent relocation that was necessary when vendors sold on the sidewalk. In terms of convenience, the relocation of street vendors can create new comfort for the community, tourists, and traders. The relocation aligns with the DIY Master Plan for the Maintenance and Development of Cultural Heritage Areas. The Special Province of Yogyakarta government aims to transform Malioboro's appearance, similar to Orchard Road in Singapore, supporting its philosophy as a UNESCO-registered cultural axis (Septian 2022).

The relocation has introduced supporting facilities that benefit both visitors and street vendors. The arrangement of merchandise becomes more organized and makes visitors feel comfortable. However, there is competition among PKL to obtain a place after the relocation. The Special Committee (Pansus) of PKL relocation supervision found several violations against people who have more than one stall in both Malioboro one and two areas. In addition, the relocation created a change to a different atmosphere for the street vendors. Many street vendors feel that the relocation has made their stalls less crowded than usual and resulted in a decrease in sales. In terms of proper arrangement, relocation is also found in Malioboro area 2, which functions as a lane for visitors but is used for selling. The arrangement of culinary and fashion stalls is so close together that it affects the circulation of air in the vicinity (Praditya, 2022). Seeing these various problems certainly stems from the formulation of policies that are less mature or can be said to be policy challenges. Therefore, the challenges associated with the relocation policy of Malioboro street vendors present an intriguing topic for further research.

RESEARCH METHOD

The type of research used in this study is qualitative research, which explores natural settings. The approach employed in this research is a narrative approach, where the data obtained is explained with the concept of narration. Qualitative research has the intention of interpreting a phenomenon that occurs, and uses various methods in its implementation. In qualitative research, the activities carried out and the impact of the activities carried out are described narratively. As for the narrative approach, the data obtained is explained using the concept of narrative. The background for using this type of approach is because it is relevant to the research that will be conducted in Malioboro. The data used is secondary data obtained from scientific articles that discuss the relocation policy of street vendors in Malioboro and books related to the implementation of the relocation policy. The data collection technique in this research uses scientific articles and books. The data collection involves analyzing bibliographies from various data sources related to relocation policies and street vendors.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Policy Formulation Analysis Study of Relocation Policy of the Street Vendors in Malioboro

The arrangement of Malioboro street vendors has long been regulated in the Mayor's Regulation on the Arrangement of Malioboro-A Special Area Street Vendors. The regulation contains the arrangement of Malioboro areas that can be used and areas that are prohibited for selling by street vendors. Street vendors are sellers who individually engage in economic activities, either selling goods or providing services, that use various places related to public facilities using mobile or stationary equipment with temporary time. Malioboro street vendors must obtain permits for their business stalls. The Malioboro street vendor arrangement policy is issued as a form of government efforts to empower the economy of the community in the informal sector (Septian 2022). The arrangement of the Malioboro area has been on the long-standing agenda of the local government to relocate street vendors. Socialization has been conducted since 2015, and the relocation of street vendors is planned for January 2022-2024. The relocation policy, which was carried out during the COVID-19 pandemic, made the government have to prepare adequate infrastructure and facilities for PKL. The Yogyakarta City Government continued the socialization of the relocation agenda by inviting PKL in 2021. Finally, the relocation of Malioboro street vendors in Malioboro Terraces I and II took effect on February 1, 2022, based on the Mayor's Regulation on the Revocation of Mayor Regulation Number 37 of 2010 concerning the Arrangement of Malioboro-Ahmad Yani Special Area Kakilima Traders.

The process of making rules regarding the relocation of Malioboro street vendors began with the draft of Regional Regulation No. 26/2002, which still did not touch the areas where street vendors were located, such as Mangkubumi Street, including Malioboro in 2022. This is what prompted the birth of the regulation to organize the PKL, which was eventually implemented. For example, the relocation of Klithikan traders from Jalan Mangkubumi was successfully implemented' (Interview with Mr. Sukirno). With the enactment of Local Regulation No. 26/2002, a Mayor's Decree was issued, which was then reinforced by a Decree of the Head of the Industry, Trade, Cooperatives, and SMEs Agency (Disperindagkop UKM) and the Sub-District Head that regulates the locations permitted for street vendors. After this policy, there are no more new licenses for street vendors except for places that have been abandoned previously based on the following decrees: 1. Decree of the Head of the Department of Industry, Trade and Cooperatives of Yogyakarta City No. 57/2007 84 on the Determination of Types of Business Places and Types of Merchandise of Street Vendors in Yogyakarta City. 2. The Decree of the Sub-district Head on

the Classes of Business Places and Merchandise of Street Vendors in the Sub-district which regulates the location points that are allowed to sell in each sub-district (Hardiyanti, 2008).

Based on the results of the identification of policy mapping, there are several variables. First, policy actors. There are several policy actors in the formulation of street vendor relocation policies in Malioboro, namely the DIY Regional Government, DIY DPRD, DIY Regional Secretariat, Yogyakarta City Government, Yogyakarta City DPRD, Cooperative and UMKM Office (DIY), and Yogyakarta City Culture Office. Second, the policy context includes the Malioboro Street area, Yogyakarta KM Zero Point area, Yogyakarta Big Post Office area, Abu Bakar Ali area north of Malioboro Street, Beringharjo Market, Yogyakarta North Square, and Yogyakarta Station. Third, policy instruments include Yogyakarta City Regional Regulation No. 26/2002 on Street Vendor Arrangement; Article 3 of Presidential Regulation No. 125/2012 on the Coordination of Street Vendor Arrangement and Empowerment; Yogyakarta Mayor Decree No. 119/2004 on Special Street Vendor Arrangement for Malioboro - Ahmad Yani Area; Yogyakarta Mayor Decree No. 93/2009 on the Establishment of Community Empowerment Organisation for Malioboro Area 2009 on the Establishment of the Malioboro Area Community Empowerment Agency of Yogyakarta City; Yogyakarta Mayor Regulation No. 37 of 2010 on the Special Arrangement of Malioboro Area Street Vendors; Yogyakarta Mayor Regulation No. 8 of 2012 on the Establishment, Structure, Position, Function, Task Details of the Malioboro Area Management Technical Implementation Unit (UPT) at the Yogyakarta City Tourism and Culture Office. Fourth, agenda setting includes road widening, sidewalk construction, green lane construction, the arrangement of Andong and becak, the arrangement of trade stalls, the relocation of parking lots, the renovation and revitalization of Beringharjo Market, the arrangement of Malioboro area, and the relocation of street vendors in Malioboro.

Policy formulation for the relocation of Malioboro street vendors involves a multifaceted approach that considers economic management, urban planning, and social impacts. Stakeholders approach the process of dialogue together to formulate effective and flexible policies (Mutiarin et al. 2019). The relocation aims to enhance the pedestrian-oriented nature of the Malioboro area by utilizing local transportation modes like becak and horse carts (Abizia, 2023). Studies have shown positive outcomes from such relocations, including improved public facilities, security, trader mobility, and time efficiency. The policy also targets the cultural and economic aspects, aiming to discipline vendors, create representative culinary areas, and address urban issues by establishing new crowd centers. Successful implementation of street vendor relocation policies hinges on factors like cultural dimensions, communication, public opinion, and consensus (Mani, 2020). Culture plays a significant role in shaping communication, fostering compliance, and building consensus among stakeholders.

The involvement of public relations in policy development and negotiation processes is crucial for the effective execution of relocation policies (Mani et al., 2017). Additionally, the policy instruments used by governments, such as in Surabaya, to relocate street vendors are essential for managing the transition (Nurany, 2021). The socio-economic impacts of street vendor relocations are a key consideration, with studies highlighting both positive and negative consequences (Damayanti, 2024). Resistance from vendors, concerns about losing customers, and the distance of relocation sites from community hubs are challenges that need to be addressed (Afrizal & Dewi, 2021). Policymakers must balance livelihoods, health considerations, and public welfare, especially during events like the COVID-19 pandemic (Thanh et al., 2021). The role of local regulations in improving economic value and supporting street vendors is crucial for sustainable urban development (Andriyansah & Rulinawaty, 2023).

CONCLUSION

The arrangement of the Malioboro area has been a long-standing agenda of the local government to relocate street vendors. The arrangement of Malioboro street vendors is regulated in the Mayor's Regulation on the Arrangement of Malioboro-Ahmad Yani Special Area Street Vendors. The regulation contains the arrangement of Malioboro areas that can be used and areas that are prohibited for selling by street vendors. Then the local government took a step by planning the relocation of street vendors in January 2022-2024. In 2022, the process of making rules regarding the relocation of Malioboro street vendors began with the draft of Regional Regulation No. 26/2002, which still did not touch the areas where street vendors were located, such as Mangkubumi Street, including Malioboro. This prompted the birth of the regulation to organize the PKL, which was eventually implemented. The relocation policy carried out during the COVID-19 pandemic made the government have to prepare adequate infrastructure and facilities for street vendors.

REFERENCES

- Afrizal, S. and Dewi, P. (2021). Dampak covid-19 pada pedagang kaki lima (pkl) di kota serang. *Jurnal Sosiologi Nusantara*, 7(2), 279-298. <https://doi.org/10.33369/jsn.7.2.279-298>
- Alaslan, Amtai. 2021. 53 CV. Pena Persada Formulasi Kebijakan Publik: Studi Relokasi Pasar. <http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.encep.2012.03.001>.
- Amanta, Luqyana, a Bevaola Kusumasari. 2019. „Intervensi Aktor dalam Mempengaruhi Formulasi Kebijakan Lingkungan : Studi Kasus Kebijakan Relokasi Tambak Udang di Yogyakarta". *Jurnal Borneo Administrator* 15(2): 179–98.
- Amri, Pahmi, Achmad Nurmandi, a Dyah Mutiarin. 2022. „the Role of Policy Actors in Determining the Direction of Disruptive Innovation Policy". *Journal of Governance and Regulation* 11(4 Special Issue): 374–86.
- Amri, Pahmi, Achmad Nurmandi, a Dyah Mutiarin. 2023. „The evolution of sharing economy policies in indonesia transportation sector from the perspective of narrative policy framework". *Journal of Infrastructure, Policy and Development* 7(1): 1–19.
- Andriyansah, A. and Rulinawaty, R. (2023). Performance of local government regulations during the pandemic to improve the economic value of city image in south sulawesi. *Media Ekonomi Dan Manajemen*, 38(1), 1. <https://doi.org/10.56444/mem.v38i1.3028>
- Damayanti, F. (2024). Dampak pedagang kaki lima dan warung kecil pasca relokasi di sentra wisata kuliner ketintang. *Jip (Jurnal Industri Dan Perkotaan)*, 19(2), 127. <https://doi.org/10.31258/jip.19.2.127-131>
- Demas, Kristia Liendika Arruan Minangga, a Ajeng Nugrahaning Dewanti. 2021. „Analisis Faktor-Faktor Yang Berpengaruh dalam Pemilihan Lokasi Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kawasan Pasar Pagi, Kota Samarinda". *Ruang* 7(2): 96–104.
- Dimas Dwiyan Putra, a Siska Sasmita. 2022. „Eksternalitas Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima di Pasar Kuliner Kota Padang Panjang". *Sosioedukasi: Jurnal Ilmiah Ilmu Pendidikan Dan Sosial* 11(2): 189–98.
- Ferizaldi, Ferizaldi. 2022. „Analisis Kebijakan Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima (K5) di Trotoar Jalan Protokol Kota Lhokseumawe". *Asia-Pacific Journal of Public Policy* 8(2): 69–78.
- Hidayah, Fitria Nur, a Warsono. „Resistensi Pedagang Kaki Lima Alun-Alun Bojonegoro Terhadap Kebijakan Relokasi Pemerintah Kabupaten Bojonegoro". 8(1): 47–55.

- Imanda, Mochammad Bisma, a Rusdarti Rusdarti. 2020. „Kebijakan dan Implementasi Program Relokasi PKL Kawasan Tlogosari Kota Semarang". *Efficient: Indonesian Journal of Development Economics* 3(1): 616–24.
- Mani, L. (2020). Cultural dimensions, communication, public opinion, and consensus: a study of the implementation of street vendor relocation policy in yogyakarta city, indonesia. *Humanities & Social Sciences Reviews*, 8(4), 463-472. <https://doi.org/10.18510/hssr.2020.8445>
- Mani, L., Guntoro, B., Mudiyo, M., & Prajarto, N. (2017). Eksistensi public relation pemerintah kota yogyakarta dalam komunikasi dan negosiasi kebijakan relokasi pedagang kaki lima. *Jurnal Ekonomi*, 21(3). <https://doi.org/10.24912/je.v21i3.22>
- Mujaddidi, Ah Shibghatullah. 2022. „Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima Terhadap Kondisi Sosial Ekonomi (Studi Pedagang Kaki Lima di Arek Lancor Pamekasan)". 2(2): 127–36.
- Mutiarin, Dyah et al. 2019. „How do government regulations and policies respond to the growing online-enabled transportation service (OETS) in Indonesia, the Philippines, and Taiwan?" *Digital Policy, Regulation and Governance* 21(4): 419–37.
- Nurany, F. (2021). The policy instruments of street vendor relocation in surabaya bulak fish center. *Dia*, 19(1), 68-84. <https://doi.org/10.30996/dia.v19i1.4800>
- Oktarina Abizia, Sugiyanto, S., Rini Dorajati, & Irsasri, I. (2023). Mindset of the future of street trader in teras malioboro. *International Journal of Social Science*, 2(6), 2453-2464. <https://doi.org/10.53625/ijss.v2i6.5602>
- Pasciana, Rostiena, Pupung Pundenswari, a Gina Sadrina. 2019. „Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima (Pkl) untuk Memperindah Kota Garut". *Kolaborasi: Jurnal Administrasi Publik* 5(3): 288– 303.
- Pitamaha, Erra, a Sugi Rahayu. „Manajemen Tata Ruang Kawasan Malioboro Berorientasi Pembangunan Berkelanjutan di Kota Yogyakarta". : 1–16.
- Pratiwi, Melinda Putri, Arifah Ratna Sari, a Siska Praditya. 2022. „Analisis Pengaruh Sosial Ekonomi Kebijakan Relokasi Malioboro Terhadap Pedagang Kaki Lima". *Khazanah: Jurnal Mahasiswa* 14(2): 56–63.
- Safaria, Anne Friday, Sri Sumiati, a Tintin Karwati. 2020. „Implementasi Kebijakan Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kabupaten Sumedang". *Journal Of Regional Public Administration (JRPA)* 5(2): 92–100. <http://jurnal.ilmuadministrasisebelasapril.ac.id/index.php/jrpa/article/view/74>
- Sapulete, Casey Meilinda, Welson Y.Rompas, a Novie Palar. 2022. „Evaluasi Kebijakan Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kota Manado Provinsi Sulawesi Utara". *Braz Dent J.* 33(1): 1–12.
- Septian, E. 2022. „Transformasi Konflik Kebijakan Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima di Kawasan Malioboro, Kota Yogyakarta". *Kolaborasi: Jurnal Administrasi Publik* 8(3). <https://journal.unismuh.ac.id/index.php/kolaborasi/article/view/9190%0Ahttps://journal.unismuh.ac.id/index.php/kolaborasi/article/download/9190/5504>.
- Setiawan, Alan, Hendrianto Sundaro, a Agus Sarwo Edy Sudrajat. 2022. „Kajian Dampak Kebijakan Relokasi PKL Bantaran Kali Es Sawah Besar Kota Semarang Terhadap Kondisi Sosial dan Ekonomi Pedagang".
- Sofyan, Abu. 2022. „Strategi Komunikasi Organisasi Pemerintah Kabupaten Bondowoso dalam Relokasi PKL Alun-Alun Rba Ki Ronggo". : 63–77.
- Suprianik, a Zainuri. 2022. „Analisis Modal Sosial dan Biaya Transaksi untuk Relokasi Pedagang Kaki Lima, Mungkinkah? Studi Kasus di Jalan Jawa-Kabupaten Jember". *Jurnal Ekonomi dan Bisnis* 11(1): 49–58.

Thanh, P., Nguyen, H., Ngan, L., Nguyen, D., Phan, G., & Nguyen, T. (2021). No one left behind: risk communication to the street vendors during covid-19 social distancing. *Library Hi Tech*, 40(2), 357-375. <https://doi.org/10.1108/lht-03-2021-0100>

Utomo, Sugeng Hadi et al. 2019. „Kebijakan Publik dan Dampaknya Terhadap Aktivitas Pedagang Kaki Lima (PKL): Studi Kasus di Kota Batu". *Jurnal Transaksi* 11(1): 44–50.